THE ROLE OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE TRUSTEE

ADVANCING SUCCESS FOR MEN OF COLOR IN COMMUNITY COLLEGES

Frank Harris III & J Luke Wood
San Diego State University
“There are a lot of kids out there who need help, who are getting a lot of negative reinforcement. And is there more that we can do to give them the sense that their country cares about them and values them and is willing to invest in them?”

– President Obama, July 19, 2013
The President Speaks on His "America's College Promise" Proposal

January 09, 2015  |  47:50  |  Public Domain

President Obama delivers remarks about his new community college proposal at Pellissippi State Community College in Knoxville, Tennessee, January 9, 2015.

Download mp4 (1770MB) | mp3 (46MB)
What is M²C³?

M²C³ is an initiative that was established to partner with community colleges to build the institutional capacity necessary to facilitate student success for men who have been historically underrepresented and underserved in postsecondary education.
Community Colleges
Who Are Our Black and Latino Men?

Latino Men
- 43% delayed enrollment into college
- 81% are first-generation Students
- 48% are low-income
- 43% in need of remedial education

Black Men
- 54% delayed enrollment into college
- 74% are first-generation Students
- 59% are low-income

947 community colleges serve
64% of all Black men and
65% of all Latino men
in public postsecondary education

44% in need of remedial education

50% Attend college less than full-time

49% Attend college less than full-time

Source: National Postsecondary Student Aid Study

@jlukewood
@fharris3

Minority Male Community College Collaborative
A Call to Action
Success Outcomes for Black & Latino Men in the Community College

Persistence
37% of Black Men Persisted through 3 years of college
46% of Latino Men Persisted through 3 years of college
49% all other men Persisted through 3 years of college

Achievement
23% of Black Men Have 3.5 GPA or higher
22% of Latino Men Have 3.5 GPA or higher
34% all other men Have 3.5 GPA or higher

Attainment
11% of Black Men Attained their degree goals
10% of Latino Men Attained their degree goals
16% all other men Attained their degree goals

Transfer
20% of Black Men Transferred to a 4-year college or university
19% of Latino Men Transferred to a 4-year college or university
35% all other men Transferred to a 4-year college or university

Note: All rates calculated at 150% of normal time. Transfer rates only include students who had transfer as a goal upon entry. Degree attainment includes certificate and associate degrees only. Source: Beginning Postsecondary Students Longitudinal Study

@fharris3  @j lukewood
Why Do These Outcomes Matter?

• Part of the national dialogue
• Economic impact
• Prison industry
• Rich pool of talent for jobs
• Student equity plans
• Benefits all students
“Every system is perfectly designed to achieve the results it gets.”

(attributed to W. Edward Deming and Paul Batalden)

“It is futile to dwell on students’ past experiences. It is also harmful if inequalities are rationalized as beyond the control of practitioners. Instead we must focus on what is within the control of educators in terms of changing their own practices to meet the needs and circumstances of men of color.”

(Harris, Bensimon & Bishop, 2010)
“Data” versus “Inquiry”

The Data Paradigm:

Data → Gaps in Educational Outcomes → Solutions (Best Practices)

The Inquiry Paradigm:

Data → Gaps → Inquiry into the Causes → Informed Solutions → Evaluation of Implemented Solutions

Bensimon, 2004
Socio-Ecological Outcomes (SEO) Model

Inputs

Background/Defining Factors
- Age
- Time Status
- Veteran Status
- Primary Language
- Citizenship Status
- Generation Status
- [Dis]ability

Societal Factors
- Stereotypes
- Prejudice
- Economic Conditions
- Capital Identity Projection
- Mass Incarceration

Socio-Ecological Domains

Non-Cognitive Domain
- Intrapersonal (Self-Efficacy) (Locus of Control) (Degree Utility) (Action Control) (Intrinsic Interest)
- Identity (Gender) x (Racial/Ethnic) x (Spiritual) x (Sexual)

Academic Domain
- Faculty-Student Interaction
- Academic Service Use
- Commitment to Course of Study

Environmental Domain
- Mediators (Finances) (Transportation) (External Validating Agents)
- Commitments (Family Responsibilities) (Employment)
- Stressful Life Events

Campus Ethos Domain
- Sense of Belonging (Student-Student) (Student-Faculty) (Student-Student Service)
- Campus Racial/Gender Climate
- Welcomeness to Engage
- Campus Resources (Access) (Efficacy)
- Internal Validating Agents (Faculty) (Staff)

Outcomes

Student Success
- Persistence
- Achievement
- Attainment
- Transfer
- Goal Accomplishment
- Labor Market
Why Assess?

• To **illuminate** systemic trends and patterns
• To **foster** critical conversations on student equity
• To **facilitate** organizational learning on promising practices and strategies
• To **identify** areas in need of enhanced attention
• To **recognize** and enhance evident strengths and opportunities
• To **test** the validity of common assumptions
• To **identify** what is ‘known’ and what is ‘unknown’
• To **reassess** the institutional strategic plan
The Assessment Cycle

1. Set the Stage
2. Form a "Working Group"
3. Clarify the Purpose & Goals
4. (Re)review Existing Data
5. Engage in Assessment
6. Interpret the Findings
7. Disseminate & Plan for Action
8. Implement & Assess Action
TOOLS FOR INSTITUTIONAL SELF-ASSESSMENT ON SERVING MEN OF COLOR IN COMMUNITY COLLEGES
Community College Student Success Inventory (CCSSI)

- Six overarching areas for institutional action and support
  - Financial aid ($n=7$)
  - Student support services ($n=18$)
  - Teaching and learning ($n=13$)
  - Institutional research ($n=9$)
  - Minority male initiatives and programs ($n=14$)
  - Early alert systems ($n=6$)

- Content validation from subject matter experts (SMEs)

- Results published in the *Community College Journal of Research and Practice* (Harris & Wood, 2014).
# Community College Student Success Inventory (CCSSI)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Not at All</th>
<th>Minimally</th>
<th>Proficiently</th>
<th>Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 The institution has an early alert system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Faculty and staff are trained on how to use the system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Faculty and staff use the system regularly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 The system allows for the timely feedback to students (feedback early on during academic term)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 The system facilitates referrals to student support services (e.g., financial, counseling, academic advising)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Students are aware of the system (i.e., via catalogs, counselors/advisers, orientations, student success program websites) and how it is used to facilitate their success</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Minority Male Initiative: Comments**

**Areas of Strength / Opportunities**

**Areas of Weakness / Improvement**
Community College Survey of Men (CCSM)

• An institution-level quantitative assessment that is used for:
  – Benchmarking
  – Performance Monitoring
  – Identifying areas in need of enhanced attention

• Grounded theoretically by the SEO model and informed by the published research

• Rigorously validated over a three year period

• Completed by nearly 9,000 respondents enrolled @ 50+ Community Colleges in 8 States
Community College Survey of Men (CCSM)

Instructions: Please use a pen or pencil to completely fill in your responses on the survey. Here are three tips for completing the survey: 1) move quickly through the survey; 2) Don’t overthink the questions, respond with your initial instinct; and 3) be honest, your responses are only helpful to the degree that they are accurate.

1. Please indicate your racial/ethnic affiliation (mark only one category)
   - White/Caucasian
   - Asian American (excluding Southeast Asian)
   - Southeast Asian (e.g., Cambodian, Hmong, Laotian, Vietnamese)
   - South Asian (e.g., Indian, Pakistani, Sri-Lankan)
   - Pacific Islander or Hawaiian
   - Filipino
   - Black or African American
   - Mexican or Mexican American
   - Hispanic or Latino (excluding Mexican descent)
   - American Indian or Alaskan Native
   - Middle Eastern
   - Other (please specify)
   - Multiracial (please specify)

2. Please indicate your age.
   - Under 18
   - 18-24
   - 25-31
   - 32-38
   - 39-45
   - 46-52
   - 53-59
   - 60-66
   - 67 or older

3. How many individuals depend on you for financial support (e.g., children, siblings, parents, grandparents)?
   - None
   - 1
   - 2
   - 3
   - 4
   - 5 or more

4. Please indicate the following regarding military service.
   - None
   - Veteran
   - Active Duty
   - Reserve

5. Please describe your sexual orientation?
   - Heterosexual “straight”
   - Gay/Lesbian
   - Bisexual
   - Non-Conforming
   - Other (please specify)

6. Please respond to the following birth origin statements.
   - I was born in the United States or U.S. Territory
   - One or both of my parents were born in the United States or U.S. Territory
   - Yes
   - No

7. Are you on a college varsity (not intramural) athletic team? If so, in what sport?
   - Not a varsity athlete
   - Yes, Women’s
     - Badminton
     - Basketball
     - Cross Country
     - Sand Volleyball
     - Soccer
     - Softball
     - Swimming/Diving
   - Yes, Men’s
     - Baseball
     - Basketball
     - Cross Country
     - Football
     - Soccer
     - Swimming/Diving
   - Tennis
     - Track and Field
     - Volleyball
     - Water Polo

8. What is your annual income? (Please report what you and other family members who support you made. Include income from all sources (e.g., work, government aid, stocks))
   - Under $10,000
   - $10,001 - $20,000
   - $20,001 - $30,000
   - $30,001 - $40,000
   - $40,001 - $50,000
   - $50,001 - $100,000
This item reflects students’ responses to the following statement: “Staff who regularly tells me that I belong at this institution”. This variable reflects the degree to which students receive validation from staff. Higher scores reflect greater levels of validation.

This item is part of the staff validation construct.
Help Seeking: Comfortable Asking for Help
CCSM Item Frequency Report

This item reflects students’ responses to the degree to which they are comfortable asking for help from others (e.g., faculty, staff) when they need it. Higher scores reflect more healthy conceptions of help-seeking behavior. This item is part of the help-seeking behavior construct.
Community College Insights Protocol (CCIP)

• A framework for obtaining qualitative insights about how men of color experience community colleges

• A consensus group protocol
  – Participants collaboratively identify challenges and propose recommendations for needed action

• Focused primarily on identifying:
  – salient challenges for men of color
  – factors that enable men of color to overcome salient challenges
  – institutional practices that facilitate success for men of color
  – what campuses should be doing to support men of color
## Community College Insights Protocol (CCIP) Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What challenges do you face as a man of color at this college?</th>
<th>What factors help you to overcome these challenges?</th>
<th>What is the campus currently doing that helps men of color succeed at this colleges?</th>
<th>What advice would you offer to campus leaders to help them better serve men of color at this college?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Community College Insights Protocol (CCIP) Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What challenges do you face as a man of color at this college?</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>What factors help you to overcome these challenges?</th>
<th>What is the campus currently doing that helps men of color succeed at this college?</th>
<th>What advice would you offer to campus leaders to help them better serve men of color at this college?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Racial stereotypes | 75% | • Drive and motivation  
• Being able to talk to a counselor | • Offering a student success course for men of color | • Hire more Black and Latino professors |
| 2. Low expectations from faculty | | | | |
| 3. Feeling like “no one cares about me” | | | | |
Male Program Assessment for College Excellence (M-PACE)

- A program-level outcomes based assessment tool
- Designed for repeated measures designs
- Based on a synthesis of program outcomes and services commonly employed by MMIs
  - leadership development, mentoring, college survival skills, community learning opportunities, tutoring, academic advising, cohort study sessions, counseling, career planning, and books clubs
# Male Program Assessment for College Excellence (M-PACE)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Leadership/Professional Development</th>
<th>Mentoring</th>
<th>College Survival Skills</th>
<th>Service/Community Learning Opportunities</th>
<th>Tutoring</th>
<th>Academic Advising</th>
<th>Cohort Study Sessions</th>
<th>Counseling</th>
<th>Career Planning</th>
<th>Literacy/Book Club</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Affective</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>academic self-efficacy</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sense of belonging</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(connection to faculty &amp; staff)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>personal self-confidence</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>resilience</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>internal locus of control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self-esteem</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>racial affinity</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Performance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>persistence (retention)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>transfer</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement (GPA)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>graduation</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of academic services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>student-faculty engagement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Male Program Assessment for College Excellence (M-PACE)

• Focused on outcomes in two areas

  – *Affective* - academic self-efficacy; sense of belonging, self-confidence, resilience, locus of control, self-esteem, racial affinity, social justice orientation, socio-emotional intelligence, collaborative leadership

  – *Performance* - anticipated persistence, transfer readiness, achievement (GPA), graduation readiness, use of services, faculty-student interactions.
Male Program Assessment for College Excellence (M-PACE)

**EVALUATION COPY**

**Male - Program Assessment for College Excellence (M-PACE)**

**Instructions:** Please use a pen or pencil to completely fill in your responses on the survey. Here are three tips for completing the survey: 1) move QUICKLY through the survey; 2) Don’t overthink the questions, respond with your INITIAL INSTINCT; and 3) BE HONEST, your responses are only helpful to the degree that they are accurate.

1. Please indicate your racial/ethnic affiliation (mark only one category)
   - White/ Caucasian
   - Asian American (excluding Southeast Asian)
   - Southeast Asian (e.g., Cambodian, Hmong, Laotian, Vietnamese)
   - South Asian (e.g., Indian, Pakistani, Sri-Lankan)
   - Pacific Islander or Hawaiian
   - Filipino
   - Black or African American
   - Mexican or Mexican American
   - Hispanic or Latino (excluding Mexican descent)
   - American Indian or Alaskan Native
   - Middle Eastern
   - Other (please specify) ____________________________
   - Multiracial (please specify) ____________________________

2. Please indicate your age.
   - Under 18
   - 18-24
   - 25-31
   - 32-38
   - 39-45
   - 46-52
   - 53-59
   - 60-66
   - 67 or older

3. Please describe your sexual orientation?
   - Heterosexual “straight”
   - Gay
   - Bisexual
   - Non-Conforming
   - Other (please specify) ____________________________

4. Please respond to the following birth origin statements.
   - I was born in the United States or U.S. Territory
   - One or both of my parents were born in the United States or U.S. Territory

5. Are you on a college varsity (not intramural) athletic team? If so, in what sport?
   - Not a varsity athlete
   - Baseball
   - Basketball
   - Cross Country
   - Football
   - Soccer
   - Swimming/Diving
   - Tennis
   - Track and Field
   - Volleyball
   - Water Polo

6. What is your annual income (Please report what you and other family members who support you made. Include income from all sources e.g., work, government aid, stocks)?
   - Under $10,000
   - $10,001-20,000
   - $20,001-30,000
   - $30,001 - 40,000
   - $40,001 - 50,000
   - $50,001 - 60,000
   - $60,001 - 70,000
   - $70,001 - 80,000
   - $80,001 - 90,000
   - $90,001 - 100,000
   - $100,001 - 110,000
   - $110,001 or more

7. Please indicate your high school GPA (on a 4.0 scale), regardless of whether you completed high school.
   - 0.0 to 0.9 (F to D)
   - 1.0 to 1.4 (D to C-)
   - 1.5 to 1.9 (C- to C)
   - 2.0 to 2.4 (C to B-)
   - 2.5 to 2.9 (B- to B)
   - 3.0 to 3.4 (B to A-)
   - 3.5 to 4.0 (A to A)
Implications for Policy

• Implement a *statewide/district-wide early alert system*.

• Create programs to *reclaim “near completers”*—those who have completed a substantial proportion of college units but have not completed their degrees.

• Establish *measureable student success goals* for men of color and/or historically underserved students.

• Require student outcomes data to be *disaggregated by gender within race/ethnicity*.

• *Refine ethnic classifications* to better account for outcome disparities that are experienced by diverse student populations.

• Assign an increased percentage of *full-time faculty to gatekeeper and basic skills courses*. 
Implications for Policy

• Establish policies regarding *ongoing professional development for faculty and staff* to better serve men of color and/or historically underserved students.

• *Partner with the business industry* to create internships and other co-curricular opportunities.

• *Intrasystem collaboration between colleges and districts* to ease system navigation

• Include “*serving historically underrepresented and underserved students*” in institutional mission statements and strategic plans (especially for minority-serving institutions).

• Create a *statewide educational initiative* for men of color.

• Ensure that men of color are equitably represented among students who *transfer*
Implications for Policy

- Develop stronger mechanisms for assessing the effectiveness of retention programs designed to serve historically underserved students

- Scalability of FYE and other programs that have a track record of success on key student outcomes

- Imbed assessment of disproportionate impact by race/ethnicity within gender in equity plans
Contact Information & Advisory Board

Minority Male Community College Collaborative (M2C3)

Frank Harris III & J. Luke Wood, Co-Directors
Administration, Rehabilitation, & Postsecondary Education Department
San Diego State University
m2c3@mail.sdsu.edu
http://interwork.sdsu.edu/sp/m2c3/
@minoritymaleccc @jlukewood @fharris3

George R. Boggs, Ph.D.
President & CEO Emeritus
American Association of Community Colleges

Edward C. Bush, Ph.D.
Vice President for Student Services
Riverside Community College

Shaun R. Harper, Ph.D.
Associate Professor and Director
Center for the Study of Race and Equity in Education
University of Pennsylvania

Samuel D. Museus, Ph.D.
Associate Professor of Higher Education
University of Denver

Rita Cepeda, Ed.D.
Chancellor
San Jose—Evergreen Community College District

Ned Doffoney, Ed.D.
Chancellor
North Orange County Community College District

William E. Piland, Ed.D.
Professor Emeritus, Postsecondary Education
San Diego State University

Victor B. Saenz, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Higher Education
University of Texas at Austin

Margaret Ford Fisher, Ed.D.
President
Houston Community College - Northeast

Rosemary Gillett-Karam, Ph.D.
Director, Community College Leadership
Doctoral Program
Morgan State University

Ronald Williams, Ph.D.
Vice President Emeritus
The College Board
THE ROLE OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE TRUSTEE

ADVANCING SUCCESS FOR MEN OF COLOR IN COMMUNITY COLLEGES

Frank Harris III & J Luke Wood
San Diego State University

Picture Source: Blackstarproject